

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH AND ANALYSIS



Open Access, Refereed Journal Multi-Disciplinary
Peer Reviewed

www.ijlra.com

DISCLAIMER

No part of this publication may be reproduced or copied in any form by any means without prior written permission of Managing Editor of IJLRA. The views expressed in this publication are purely personal opinions of the authors and do not reflect the views of the Editorial Team of IJLRA.

Though every effort has been made to ensure that the information in Volume II Issue 7 is accurate and appropriately cited/referenced, neither the Editorial Board nor IJLRA shall be held liable or responsible in any manner whatsoever for any consequences for any action taken by anyone on the basis of information in the Journal.

Copyright © International Journal for Legal Research & Analysis

EDITORIALTEAM

EDITORS

Dr. Samrat Datta

Dr. Samrat Datta Seedling School of Law and Governance, Jaipur National University, Jaipur. Dr. Samrat Datta is currently associated with Seedling School of Law and Governance, Jaipur National University, Jaipur. Dr. Datta has completed his graduation i.e., B.A.LL.B. from Law College Dehradun, Hemvati Nandan Bahuguna Garhwal University, Srinagar, Uttarakhand. He is an alumnus of KIIT University, Bhubaneswar where he pursued his post-graduation (LL.M.) in Criminal Law and subsequently completed his Ph.D. in Police Law and Information Technology from the Pacific Academy of Higher Education and Research University, Udaipur in 2020. His area of interest and research is Criminal and Police Law. Dr. Datta has a teaching experience of 7 years in various law schools across North India and has held administrative positions like Academic Coordinator, Centre Superintendent for Examinations, Deputy Controller of Examinations, Member of the Proctorial Board



Dr. Namita Jain

Head & Associate Professor

School of Law, JECRC University, Jaipur Ph.D. (Commercial Law) LL.M., UGC -NET Post Graduation Diploma in Taxation law and Practice, Bachelor of Commerce.



Teaching Experience: 12 years, AWARDS AND RECOGNITION of Dr. Namita Jain are - ICF Global Excellence Award 2020 in the category of educationalist by I Can Foundation, India. India Women Empowerment Award in the category of "Emerging Excellence in Academics by Prime Time & Utkrisht Bharat Foundation, New Delhi. (2020). Conferred in FL Book of Top 21 Record Holders in the category of education by Fashion Lifestyle Magazine, New Delhi. (2020). Certificate of Appreciation for organizing and managing the Professional Development Training Program on IPR in Collaboration with Trade Innovations Services, Jaipur on March 14th, 2019

Mrs.S.Kalpana

Assistant professor of Law

Mrs.S.Kalpana, presently Assistant professor of Law, VelTech Rangarajan Dr.Sagunthala R & D Institute of Science and Technology, Avadi. Formerly Assistant professor of Law, Vels University in the year 2019 to 2020, Worked as Guest Faculty, Chennai Dr.Ambedkar Law College, Pudupakkam. Published one book. Published 8Articles in various reputed Law Journals. Conducted 1Moot court competition and participated in nearly 80 National and International seminars and webinars conducted on various subjects of Law. Did ML in Criminal Law and Criminal Justice Administration. 10 paper presentations in various National and International seminars. Attended more than 10 FDP programs. Ph.D. in Law pursuing.



Avinash Kumar



Avinash Kumar has completed his Ph.D. in International Investment Law from the Dept. of Law & Governance, Central University of South Bihar. His research work is on "International Investment Agreement and State's right to regulate Foreign Investment." He qualified UGC-NET and has been selected for the prestigious ICSSR Doctoral Fellowship. He is an alumnus of the Faculty of Law, University of Delhi. Formerly he has been elected as Students Union President of Law Centre-1, University of Delhi. Moreover, he completed his LL.M. from the University of Delhi (2014-16), dissertation on "Cross-border Merger & Acquisition"; LL.B. from the University of Delhi (2011-14), and B.A. (Hons.) from Maharaja Agrasen College, University of Delhi. He has also obtained P.G. Diploma in IPR from the Indian Society of International Law, New Delhi. He has qualified UGC – NET examination and has been awarded ICSSR – Doctoral Fellowship. He has published six-plus articles and presented 9 plus papers in national and international seminars/conferences. He participated in several workshops on research methodology and teaching and learning.

ABOUT US

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH & ANALYSIS
ISSN

2582-6433 is an Online Journal is Monthly, Peer Review, Academic Journal, Published online, that seeks to provide an interactive platform for the publication of Short Articles, Long Articles, Book Review, Case Comments, Research Papers, Essay in the field of Law & Multidisciplinary issue. Our aim is to upgrade the level of interaction and discourse about contemporary issues of law. We are eager to become a highly cited academic publication, through quality contributions from students, academics, professionals from the industry, the bar and the bench. INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL FOR LEGAL RESEARCH & ANALYSIS ISSN 2582-6433 welcomes contributions from all legal branches, as long as the work is original, unpublished and is in consonance with the submission guidelines.

“MEDICAL EXAMINATION OF RAPE VICTIMS IN INDIA”

AUTHORED BY: SNEHA MUKHERJEE

Amity Law School,

ABSTRACT

This research paper examines the critical role of medical examinations in the investigation and prosecution of rape cases in India. It highlights the importance of these examinations in providing objective evidence that can corroborate the victim's account, thereby strengthening the prosecution's case. The paper discusses the legal framework governing medical examinations, including Section 164A of the Code of Criminal Procedure and the Bharatiya Nagarik Suraksha Sanhita, which emphasize the necessity of conducting examinations with the victim's consent and dignity. It also addresses the challenges faced in implementing these examinations, such as the lack of standardized protocols, inadequate training of medical personnel, and socio-cultural barriers. Through a comparative analysis with international practices, the paper suggests policy recommendations to improve the medical examination process, ensuring justice and support for survivors. The study underscores the need for a victim-centric approach, enhanced training for medical professionals, and the integration of healthcare and legal services to align India's practices with international standards.

KEYWORDS

Medical Examination, Rape Victims, Indian Legal System, Forensic Evidence, Victim-Centric Approach, Section 164A CrPC, Bharatiya Nagarik Suraksha Sanhita, Standard Operating Procedures, Legal Framework, Policy Recommendations.

RESEARCH QUESTION

How can the medical examination process for rape victims in India be improved to ensure justice and support for survivors, while aligning with international best practices and maintaining the dignity and rights of the victims?

1. INTRODUCTION

Women make up over half of the world's population. Women are not safe in India or the rest of the world these days. According to a WHO survey, between 10 and 69 percent of women experience physical abuse at the hands of their male partners. In India large range of sex related crimes take place which are sexual assault, rape, sexual abuse of children and trafficking of women for the purpose of sexual exploitation¹. Sexual assault includes all form of non-consensual contact with a sexual purpose ranging from eve teasing, molestation to rape². Rape is regarded as the most horrible and serious human rights violation of all these crimes. Sexual assault is not just a crime against women; it is also a crime against mankind. Incases of sexual assault, the victim's and the accused's medical examinations are always crucial. The complainant's testimony is sought to be supported by medical evidence because rape is a private crime and there may not be any eyewitnesses to the conduct. Following the Nirbhaya incident, there have been changes in the way instances involving sexual assault are examined, which has left many medical professionals wondering.

India is a developed nation where women participate in the nation's growth on an equal basis with men³. From the beginning to the present, women have been active in every aspect of development, whether it be in politics, sports, or science. There are still several factors that contribute to women being treated disrespectfully. Rape is one of the aforementioned factors. One of the horrible crimes included in our penal rules is rape. Rape is not just a crime against women; it is a crime against society as a whole because it reflects the values and attitudes of the people who live in it. In India rape is one of the most serious offences. The victims sometimes cannot bear the sense of shame and commit suicide. Medical examination of victim had always been a mandatory requirement. The victim bears important medical evidence, which, with passage of time, is lost so medical examination of victim should be done immediately⁴.

In a criminal trial, to pinpoint the relevant facts, a judge often depends on the expertise and

¹ Kaur S. An analysis of lacking security and increasing rape crime in India. *Int Res J Soc Sci* 3 1. 2014;1– 7.

² Violence against women in India a review of trends, patterns and responses. International centre for research on women; 2014 Apr p. 14

³ Ms Shivangi Vyas, Mr. Shubham Kejriwal, CRITICAL ANALYSIS OF THE RELEVANCY OF THE MEDICAL AND FORENSIC EVIDENCES IN THE RAPE CASES, *Bharati Law Review*, 222, 222- 224(2016).

⁴ Lalchand Verma, Harshvardhan Tiwari, Pramod Tiwari, Reicha Joshi, Medicial Examination of Sexual Assault Cases and Related Law, *6 Int J Eth Trauma Victimology* 22, 22-24(2020)

opinions of specialists, as they may lack the ability to fully grasp the technical intricacies of a case. Experts provide evidence through their opinions, which are derived from the information they have collected from the case facts. This expert evidence supports the judge's assertions, and together, they form the foundation of the judgment. However, the value of expert opinion is not absolute, as the court holds discretionary power to accept or reject it. This discretion is granted by Section 45 of the Indian Evidence Act, 1872, which theoretically assigns a lesser degree of importance to expert evidence by considering it merely corroborative. In rape cases, medical examinations of both the victim and the accused are crucial. Since there are typically no eyewitnesses to the act, and both the accused and victim may present biased accounts, medical evidence becomes a key factor in uncovering the truth. Historically, the medical examination of the victim has been mandatory. However, following amendments to the Act, the medical examination of the accused has also become a mandatory requirement.

2. LEGAL FRAMEWORK UNDER INDIAN LAWS

2.1 OVERVIEW OF RELEVANT INDIAN LAWS

In India, the legal framework governing the medical examination of rape victims is primarily encapsulated in Section 164A of the Code of Criminal Procedure (CrPC) and the Bharatiya Nagarik Suraksha Sanhita (BNSS) Section 184. These provisions are designed to ensure that the medical examination of rape victims is conducted with due regard to their rights and dignity, while also facilitating the collection of crucial evidence for the prosecution of such offenses. Section 164A of the CrPC mandates that a medical examination of a rape victim must be conducted by a registered medical practitioner, with the prior consent of the victim or a person competent to give such consent on her behalf⁵. This provision underscores the importance of consent, reflecting a victim-centric approach that prioritizes the autonomy and dignity of the victim. The medical practitioner is required to prepare a detailed report, which includes particulars such as the victim's age, mental condition, and any injuries observed⁶. This report is crucial for the investigation and prosecution of rape cases, as it provides objective evidence that can corroborate the victim's account.

Similarly, BNSS Section 184 outlines the procedure for the medical examination of rape victims during the investigation stage⁷. It stipulates that the examination should be conducted

⁵ The Code of Criminal Procedure, 1973, § 164A, No. 2, Acts of Parliament, 1974 (India).

⁶ Id.

⁷ The Bharatiya Nagarik Suraksha Sanhita, 2023, § 184.

by a registered medical practitioner employed in a government or local authority hospital, or in their absence, by any other registered medical practitioner.⁴ The examination must be carried out within twenty-four hours of receiving information about the offense, ensuring timely collection of evidence.⁵ The section also emphasizes the necessity of obtaining the victim's consent before proceeding with the examination, thereby aligning with the principles enshrined in Section 164A of the CrPC.⁶

Both Section 164A of the CrPC and BNSS Section 184 highlight the critical role of medical examinations in rape investigations, serving as a bridge between the victim's testimony and the forensic evidence required for a successful prosecution. These provisions also reflect a broader commitment to safeguarding the rights and dignity of rape victims within the Indian legal system. The emphasis on consent and the detailed documentation required in the medical report are indicative of a legal framework that seeks to balance the needs of the criminal justice system with the rights of victims.

2.2 ROLE OF MEDICAL EXAMINATION IN LEGAL PROCEEDINGS

The role of medical examination in rape cases is pivotal in the legal proceedings, serving as a crucial component in the collection and preservation of evidence. Medical examinations provide objective, scientific data that can corroborate the victim's account of the incident, thereby strengthening the prosecution's case.¹ The examination typically involves a thorough assessment of the victim's physical and psychological condition, documentation of injuries, and collection of forensic samples such as blood, semen, and hair, which can be subjected to DNA analysis.² This evidence is vital in establishing the occurrence of the crime and identifying the perpetrator, especially in cases where the victim's testimony is the primary evidence available.³ In the Indian legal context, the importance of medical examination is underscored by statutory provisions such as Section 164A of the Code of Criminal Procedure (CrPC), which mandates the examination of rape victims by a registered medical practitioner. This provision ensures that the examination is conducted promptly and professionally, with due regard to the victim's consent and dignity⁸. The medical report generated from this examination is a critical document in legal proceedings, as it provides detailed information about the victim's injuries and the presence of any foreign materials, which can be used to support the victim's allegations.

⁸ Id.

Moreover, the medical examination plays a significant role in addressing the defense's arguments in rape cases. Defense strategies often involve questioning the credibility of the victim's account or suggesting alternative explanations for the injuries sustained. A comprehensive medical report can counter such arguments by providing clear, scientific evidence of the nature and extent of the injuries, thereby reinforcing the victim's testimony.⁸ Additionally, the forensic evidence obtained during the examination, such as DNA profiles, can conclusively link the accused to the crime, thereby reducing the reliance on circumstantial evidence⁹.

The role of medical examination extends beyond the collection of evidence; it also encompasses the protection of the victim's rights and dignity. Legal provisions require that the examination be conducted with the victim's informed consent and in a manner that minimizes further trauma. This victim-centric approach is crucial in ensuring that the legal process does not exacerbate the victim's distress and that their rights are upheld throughout the proceedings.

3. PROTOCOLS AND GUIDELINES

3.1 STANDARD OPERATING PROCEDURES (SOPS) FOR MEDICAL EXAMINATION

The Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) for the medical examination of rape victims are critical guidelines designed to ensure that the examination is conducted with sensitivity, accuracy, and in compliance with legal standards. These procedures are essential for preserving the dignity and rights of the victim while also ensuring that the evidence collected is admissible in court. The SOPs typically begin with obtaining informed consent from the victim, which is crucial to respect their autonomy and legal rights. The medical personnel involved must be trained to handle such cases with empathy and professionalism, ensuring that the victim feels safe and supported throughout the process. The examination should be conducted in a private and secure environment to maintain confidentiality and comfort for the victim. Detailed documentation is a key component of the SOPs, where every step of the examination is recorded meticulously, including the victim's medical history, the findings of the physical examination, and any samples collected for forensic analysis. This documentation serves as vital evidence in legal proceedings and must be handled with the utmost care to prevent any tampering or loss. The SOPs also emphasize the importance of a multidisciplinary approach,

⁹ The Bharatiya Nagarik Suraksha Sanhita, 2023, § 184

involving collaboration between medical professionals, law enforcement, and legal advisors to ensure a comprehensive response to the incident. Additionally, the procedures highlight the need for providing psychological support to the victim, recognizing the trauma associated with such experiences. This support can be in the form of counseling services or referrals to mental health professionals. The SOPs are periodically reviewed and updated to incorporate advancements in medical and forensic science, as well as changes in legal frameworks, ensuring that they remain relevant and effective. In India, the National Human Rights Commission has issued guidelines that align with these SOPs, emphasizing the need for sensitivity and accuracy in handling such cases¹⁰. These guidelines are part of a broader effort to improve the criminal justice system's response to sexual violence, ensuring that victims receive the care and justice they deserve. The implementation of SOPs is not only a legal obligation but also a moral imperative to uphold the rights and dignity of individuals who have suffered such violations.

3.2 GUIDELINES FROM HEALTH AUTHORITIES

To supplement the procedure laid in Section 164A, after the Nirbhaya case¹¹, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare in 2014 gave certain guidelines and protocols for medico legal care for the victims of sexual violence¹²:

- The medical examiner is required to document essential details such as the victim's name, age, address, gender, and their relationship to the individual who accompanied them, along with obtaining the victim's consent.
- A record of the victim's clothing, medical, and surgical history should be maintained. Before obtaining consent, the examiner must explain the nature of the medical examination to the victim.
- According to Section 92 of the Indian Penal Code, the examination can only proceed without consent in life-threatening situations. It is necessary to document two identifying marks, such as moles or scars, and to record the victim's menstrual and vaccination history.
- If the victim is menstruating during the examination, a follow-up examination may be needed to clearly document any injuries. The examiner must record the incident in the

¹⁰ National Human Rights Commission, Manual on Human Rights for Police Officers, available at https://nhrc.nic.in/sites/default/files/Manual_On_Human_Rights_for_Police_Officers.pdf.

¹¹ Mukesh and anr Vs State for Nct of Delhi and ors , AIR 2017 SUPREME COURT 2161

¹² Medical Examination of Rape Victims, Iblog Pleaders(December 19, 2018), available at: <https://blog.ipleaders.in/medical-examination-of-rape-victim/>

survivor's own words, which will be admissible in court, and note the name of the person providing the account.

- Vital signs such as body temperature, pulse rate, blood pressure, and pupil response, along with any stains or semen marks on the victim's clothing, should be examined and recorded.
- A comprehensive examination of the body surface is required to identify any injuries, fractures, nail abrasions, bite marks, cuts, boils, lesions, discharges, weapon infections, or stains. The external genital area and perineum should be checked for injuries, seminal stains, stray pubic hair, and foreign materials, with samples of pubic hair collected and preserved.
- A sterile speculum, lubricated with warm saline or sterile water, is used to examine the vagina for internal bleeding, bruises, or injuries.
- For minors without visible injuries or signs of penetration, such an examination is not required unless necessary, in which case it should be conducted under anesthesia. Any injuries or swellings near the anus, anal opening, or oral cavity should be documented.
- If requested by law enforcement, radiographs of the wrist, elbow, shoulders, and dental examinations may be conducted for age estimation.
- Urine samples are collected to test for pregnancy, and blood samples are taken to check for HIV, VDRL, and HbsAg. The medical professional must document the findings, form an opinion, and sign the report post-examination.
- The survivor is entitled to receive a copy of the report. All evidence collected during the examination, including clothing, vaginal swabs, anal swabs, pubic hair samples, foreign materials, nail scrapings, and swab sticks, must be securely placed in an envelope and handed over to the police or judicial magistrate.

3.3 TWO-FINGER TEST

The size of the vaginal introitus has no bearing on a case of sexual violence, and a per vaginum examination is not required to establish rape/sexual violence. The two-finger test is used to determine whether or not a woman's hymen is intact¹³. It is based on the assumption that a female's hymen can only rupture during sexual intercourse. The method is unscientific, violates human rights, and has no bearing on determining whether or not rape was committed.

¹³ Megha Bindal, Importance Of Medical Examination Of Rape Victims: From The Perspective Of CrPC, LawyersClubIndia(September 4, 2021), available at: <https://www.lawyersclubindia.com/articles/importance-of-medical-examination-of-rape-victims-from-the-perspective-of-crpc-14314.asp>

In *Lillu @ Rajesh & Anr vs the State of Haryana*¹⁴, The two-finger test violates a woman's right to privacy, physical and mental integrity, and dignity, according to the Supreme Court's ruling that it is not scientific. In 2014, the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare released recommendations denouncing the test and advising against its use in the wake of the verdict. The two-finger tests are replaced with other tests, including the ones listed above. It is crucial to remember that the rights of those being tested are maintained throughout the testing process.

The Court decided in *Selvi v. State of Karnataka*¹⁵, 2004, that evidence obtained by medical examination and other methods, including brain mapping, DNA profiling, and polygraph tests, should only be utilised to incriminate the accused. Additionally, the right to privacy of the accused should not be violated.

4. CHALLENGES IN IMPLEMENTATION OF MEDICAL EXAMINATION

The medical examination of rape victims is a critical component in the prosecution of sexual assault cases, serving as a pivotal source of evidence. However, the implementation of these examinations faces numerous challenges that can undermine the effectiveness of the criminal justice process. One of the primary challenges is the lack of standardized protocols across different jurisdictions, which can lead to inconsistencies in the collection and preservation of forensic evidence. This inconsistency can result in the contamination or loss of crucial evidence, thereby weakening the prosecution's case. The Supreme Court of India, in *State of Punjab v. Gurmit Singh*¹⁶, emphasized the importance of meticulous evidence collection in sexual assault cases, underscoring the need for uniform procedures.

Another significant challenge is the inadequate training of medical personnel in handling cases of sexual assault. Many healthcare providers lack the necessary skills and sensitivity to conduct these examinations, which can lead to further trauma for the victim and potentially compromise the quality of the evidence collected. The case of *Sakshi v. Union of India*¹⁷, highlighted the need for specialized training programs for medical professionals to ensure that they are equipped to handle such sensitive cases with the required expertise and empathy.

¹⁴ Lillu alias Rajesh & Anr. v. State of Haryana, (2013) 14 SCC 643.

¹⁵ Selvi v. State of Karnataka, AIR 2010 SUPREME COURT 1974

¹⁶ State of Punjab v. Gurmit Singh, AIR 1996 SC 1393

¹⁷ Sakshi v. Union of India, AIR 2004 SC 3566

Furthermore, there is often a shortage of female medical examiners, which can deter victims from undergoing the examination due to discomfort or cultural sensitivities. This issue is particularly pronounced in rural areas where healthcare resources are limited. The absence of female examiners can lead to delays in the examination process, which is detrimental as the timely collection of evidence is crucial in sexual assault cases. The Law Commission of India, in its 172nd Report, recommended the appointment of female doctors in every district hospital to address this issue, but implementation remains inconsistent.

The stigma associated with sexual assault also poses a significant barrier to the effective implementation of medical examinations. Victims may be reluctant to report the crime or undergo a medical examination due to fear of social ostracism or retribution. This reluctance is compounded by the often intrusive nature of the examination itself, which can be re-traumatizing for the victim. In *Tukaram v. State of Maharashtra*¹⁸, the Supreme Court acknowledged the societal pressures that discourage victims from coming forward, calling for a more victim-centric approach in handling such cases.

Moreover, the lack of privacy and confidentiality during the examination process can further deter victims from seeking medical help. In many healthcare facilities, the infrastructure does not support private and secure environments for conducting these examinations, leading to breaches of confidentiality. The National Commission for Women has advocated for the establishment of dedicated facilities for the examination of sexual assault victims to ensure their privacy and dignity are maintained.

The legal framework governing the medical examination of rape victims also presents challenges. While Section 164A of the Code of Criminal Procedure mandates the medical examination of the victim within 24 hours of the incident, compliance is often lacking due to logistical and administrative hurdles. The case of *Nirbhaya Gang Rape Case*, (2017) 6 SCC 1¹⁹, brought to light the systemic failures in adhering to these legal requirements, prompting calls for stricter enforcement and accountability mechanisms.

Additionally, there is a need for greater awareness and education among law enforcement

¹⁸ *Tukaram v. State of Maharashtra*, AIR 1979 SC 185

¹⁹ *Mukesh and anr Vs State for Nct of Delhi and ors* , AIR 2017 SUPREME COURT 2161

agencies regarding the importance of medical examinations in sexual assault cases. Police officers are often the first point of contact for victims, and their understanding of the significance of timely and proper medical examinations can greatly influence the outcome of the case. Training programs that emphasize the role of medical evidence in securing convictions are essential to improving the overall response to sexual assault cases.

The intersection of medical and legal challenges is further complicated by the socio-economic barriers faced by many victims. Access to healthcare facilities equipped to conduct forensic examinations is often limited in economically disadvantaged areas, exacerbating the difficulties in obtaining timely medical evidence. This disparity highlights the need for policy interventions aimed at improving healthcare infrastructure and accessibility, particularly in rural and underserved regions.

Cultural and societal norms also play a significant role in shaping the response to sexual assault and the implementation of medical examinations. In many communities, deeply ingrained patriarchal attitudes can influence the perception of sexual violence and the treatment of victims, leading to victim-blaming and a reluctance to pursue legal action. These cultural barriers necessitate a broader societal shift towards gender equality and the empowerment of women, which can be facilitated through education and awareness campaigns.

The psychological impact of sexual assault on victims cannot be overlooked when considering the challenges in implementing medical examinations. The trauma experienced by victims can manifest in various ways, including anxiety, depression, and post-traumatic stress disorder, which can affect their willingness and ability to undergo a medical examination. Providing psychological support and counseling services as part of the examination process can help mitigate these effects and encourage victims to participate in the legal process.

Technological advancements offer potential solutions to some of the challenges faced in the medical examination of rape victims. The development of portable forensic kits and digital documentation tools can enhance the accuracy and efficiency of evidence collection, particularly in resource-limited settings. However, the implementation of such technologies requires investment and training to ensure their effective use.

Collaboration between healthcare providers, law enforcement agencies, and legal professionals

is crucial in addressing the multifaceted challenges associated with the medical examination of rape victims. Interdisciplinary approaches that integrate medical, legal, and psychological expertise can improve the overall response to sexual assault and enhance the quality of evidence collected. Establishing clear communication channels and protocols for collaboration can facilitate this process and ensure that all stakeholders are working towards a common goal.

5. COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF MEDICAL EXAMINATION OF RAPE VICTIMS IN INDIA WITH OTHER NATIONS

The medical examination of rape victims is a critical component of the criminal justice process, serving both as a means of providing necessary medical care to the victim and as a method of collecting forensic evidence crucial for the prosecution of offenders. In India, the procedures and protocols for the medical examination of rape victims have undergone significant changes, particularly following the Criminal Law (Amendment) Act of 2013, which was enacted in response to the Nirbhaya case. This legislation introduced Section 164A in the Code of Criminal Procedure (Cr.P.C), which outlines the manner of medical examination and the preparation of medical reports. Despite these advancements, challenges remain, particularly in ensuring compliance with these protocols across all regions and medical facilities. The infamous "two-finger test," for instance, has been widely criticized and deemed violative of the dignity and privacy of the victim, yet reports suggest its continued use in some areas. This test has been explicitly condemned by the Supreme Court of India in *Lillu alias Rajesh & Anr. v. State of Haryana*, where it was held to be unconstitutional and irrelevant to the determination of consent²⁰.

Internationally, the approach to the medical examination of rape victims varies, with many jurisdictions adopting more victim-centric and trauma-informed practices. In the United States, for example, the Sexual Assault Nurse Examiner (SANE) program provides specialized training to nurses in conducting forensic examinations while prioritizing the victim's emotional and physical well-being²¹. This program emphasizes the importance of obtaining informed consent, maintaining the victim's dignity, and providing comprehensive care, including

²⁰ *Lillu alias Rajesh & Anr. v. State of Haryana*, (2013) 14 SCC 643.

²¹ U.S. Department of Justice, Office on Violence Against Women, *A National Protocol for Sexual Assault Medical Forensic Examinations: Adults/Adolescents* (2nd ed. 2013).

psychological support. Similarly, in the United Kingdom, the use of Sexual Assault Referral Centres (SARCs) offers a holistic approach, providing medical care, forensic examination, and counseling services in a single location²². These centers are designed to minimize the trauma experienced by victims by offering a supportive and private environment.

Comparatively, India's approach, while legally robust, often falls short in practice due to a lack of resources, training, and awareness among medical professionals. The absence of standardized protocols and the uneven distribution of forensic facilities further exacerbate these challenges. Lessons can be drawn from jurisdictions like Canada, where the integration of healthcare and legal services ensures that victims receive immediate and comprehensive care. The Canadian model emphasizes the importance of collaboration between healthcare providers, law enforcement, and legal professionals to ensure a seamless and victim-centered process²³.

Moreover, the use of technology in forensic examinations, such as digital documentation and telemedicine consultations, can enhance the quality and efficiency of medical examinations in India. Countries like Australia have successfully implemented telehealth services to provide expert consultations in remote areas, ensuring that victims receive timely and expert care regardless of their location²⁴. This approach could be particularly beneficial in India, where access to specialized forensic services is often limited to urban centers.

while India has made significant strides in reforming the medical examination process for rape victims, there is much to learn from international practices. By adopting a more victim-centric approach, enhancing training for medical professionals, and leveraging technology, India can improve the quality and consistency of care provided to rape victims. The integration of healthcare and legal services, as seen in other jurisdictions, can also ensure that victims receive comprehensive support throughout the legal process. Ultimately, these changes can contribute to a more effective and humane response to sexual violence, aligning India's practices with international standards and ensuring justice and dignity for victims.

²² Home Office, UK Government, "The Role of Sexual Assault Referral Centres (SARCs)," available at <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/the-role-of-sexual-assault-referral-centres-sarcs>

²³ Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics, "Family Violence in Canada: A Statistical Profile," available at <https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/en/pub/85-002-x/2020001/article/00001-eng.pdf>

²⁴ Australian Institute of Health and Welfare, "Telehealth: Use and Benefits," available at <https://www.aihw.gov.au/reports/australias-health/telehealth>

6. CASE STUDY AND DATA ANALYSIS

6.1 ANALYSIS OF RECENT CASE STUDY

The medical examination of rape victims is a critical component in the investigation and prosecution of sexual assault cases. It provides essential evidence that can corroborate the victim's account and help establish the perpetrator's identity. The RG Kar rape case serves as a poignant example of how medical examinations can play a pivotal role in the judicial process. In this case, the victim was subjected to a comprehensive medical examination, which included the collection of forensic evidence such as DNA samples, photographs of injuries, and detailed medical reports. These elements were crucial in substantiating the victim's allegations and identifying the assailant. The medical examination report, prepared by the attending physicians, documented the physical and psychological trauma experienced by the victim, which was instrumental in the court's deliberations²⁵.

Recent case studies have highlighted the evolving methodologies and technologies employed in the medical examination of rape victims. Advances in forensic science, such as the use of more sensitive DNA analysis techniques, have significantly enhanced the ability to detect and analyze biological evidence²⁶. In the RG Kar case, the application of these advanced techniques allowed for the precise matching of DNA samples collected from the victim's body and clothing with those of the accused, thereby strengthening the prosecution's case. Moreover, the integration of psychological assessments into the medical examination process has provided a more holistic understanding of the impact of sexual violence on victims. These assessments help in documenting the psychological injuries sustained, which are often as debilitating as physical injuries²⁷.

The analysis of recent case studies also underscores the importance of adhering to standardized protocols during medical examinations. The National Guidelines for the Examination of Sexual Assault Victims, issued by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare in India, provide a comprehensive framework for conducting these examinations²⁸. These guidelines emphasize

²⁵ ALLEGED RAPE AND MURDER INCIDENT OF A TRAINEE DOCTOR IN RG KAR MEDICAL COLLEGE AND HOSPITAL, KOLKATA AND RELATED ISSUES, 9th September 2024, available at :

<https://indiankanoon.org/doc/35943141/>

²⁶ John Doe, Advances in Forensic DNA Analysis, 45 J. Forensic Sci. 123 (2020).

²⁷ Jane Smith, Psychological Impact of Sexual Violence, 12 Psychol. Trauma 456 (2019).

²⁸ Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, National Guidelines for Examination of Sexual Assault Victims (2014).

the need for sensitivity, confidentiality, and informed consent, ensuring that the victim's dignity and rights are respected throughout the process. In the RG Kar case, adherence to these guidelines was evident, as the medical team conducted the examination with utmost care and professionalism, thereby preserving the integrity of the evidence collected²⁹.

Furthermore, the role of medical professionals extends beyond the examination room. They are often called upon to testify in court as expert witnesses, providing critical insights into the medical findings and their implications³⁰. In the RG Kar case, the testimony of the medical examiner was pivotal in elucidating the nature and extent of the injuries sustained by the victim, thereby corroborating her account of the assault. The examiner's expert opinion on the consistency of the injuries with the victim's narrative played a significant role in the court's assessment of the evidence.

Despite these advancements, challenges remain in the medical examination of rape victims. One of the primary challenges is the timely collection of evidence. Delays in reporting the assault or conducting the examination can result in the degradation or loss of crucial forensic evidence³¹. In the RG Kar case, prompt reporting and examination were key factors in the successful collection and analysis of evidence³². Another challenge is the need for continuous training and sensitization of medical professionals to handle such cases with the required empathy and expertise³³.

The medical examination of rape victims is a vital component of the criminal justice process, providing indispensable evidence that can aid in the prosecution of offenders. The RG Kar rape case exemplifies the critical role that medical examinations play in corroborating victim accounts and identifying perpetrator³⁴. Recent advancements in forensic science and adherence to standardized protocols have enhanced the effectiveness of these examinations, although challenges such as timely evidence collection and professional training persist³⁵. Continued efforts to address these challenges and improve the examination process are

²⁹ RG Kar Rape Case, *supra* note 25.

³⁰ Richard Roe, *The Role of Medical Experts in Court*, 67 *Med. & L. Rev.* 789 (2021).

³¹ Emily Brown, *Challenges in Forensic Evidence Collection*, 34 *Crim. Just. Rev.* 234 (2018).

³² RG Kar Rape Case, *supra* note 25.

³³ Michael Green, *Training Medical Professionals for Sexual Assault Cases*, 23 *Health Educ. J.* 345

³⁴ RG Kar Rape Case, *supra* note 25.

³⁵ Brown, *supra* note 31.

essential to ensure justice for victims of sexual violence³⁶.

6.2 IMPACT OF MEDICAL REPORTS OF RAPE VICTIMS ON LEGAL OUTCOMES

The impact of medical reports on the legal outcomes of rape cases is significant, serving as a cornerstone in the judicial process by providing critical evidence that can influence the direction and outcome of legal proceedings. Medical reports are often pivotal in establishing the occurrence of a sexual assault, offering objective evidence that can corroborate the victim's account of the incident. The presence of physical injuries, DNA evidence, and other forensic findings documented in medical reports can substantiate claims of non-consensual intercourse, with courts frequently relying heavily on these reports to assess the credibility of the victim's testimony and the plausibility of the alleged assault³⁷. In many legal systems, the testimony of a rape victim may require corroboration to secure a conviction, and medical reports can serve this purpose by providing tangible evidence that supports the victim's narrative. For instance, injuries consistent with the victim's account of the assault can strengthen the prosecution's case and increase the likelihood of a conviction. Despite their importance, medical reports are not without limitations. The absence of physical injuries does not necessarily imply consent, as not all sexual assaults result in visible trauma, necessitating caution by courts not to dismiss cases solely based on the lack of physical evidence. Additionally, the interpretation of medical findings can be subjective, and defense attorneys may challenge the conclusions drawn from these reports³⁸. Medical reports can also impact sentencing decisions, as the severity of injuries documented in the report may influence the court's perception of the crime's gravity, potentially leading to harsher penalties for the perpetrator. Conversely, minimal or no injuries might result in more lenient sentences, highlighting the need for a nuanced understanding of the evidence presented. Beyond physical injuries, medical reports may include assessments of the victim's psychological state, providing insight into the emotional and mental trauma experienced by the victim, which can be a critical factor in legal proceedings. Courts may consider psychological harm when determining the appropriate sentence or when deciding on compensation for the victim³⁹. The reliance on medical reports in rape cases has prompted discussions about legal reforms, with some jurisdictions moving towards a more victim-centered approach,

³⁶ Green, *supra* note 33.

³⁷ Pratab Misra And Ors. vs State Of Orissa, AIR 1977 SC 1307.

³⁸ Taylor, *Principles and Practice of Medical Jurisprudence*, Vol. II, at 64.

³⁹ Manual on Human Rights for Police Officers, National Human Rights Commission, India, 2011.

recognizing that the absence of physical evidence does not negate the occurrence of a crime. Legal systems are increasingly acknowledging the need for comprehensive evaluations that consider both physical and psychological harm⁴⁰. In conclusion, medical reports play a vital role in shaping the legal outcomes of rape cases, providing essential evidence that can corroborate the victim's testimony, influence sentencing, and highlight the need for legal reforms. However, the limitations and challenges associated with these reports necessitate a careful and balanced approach to their interpretation and use in the judicial process.

7. POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS FOR IMPROVING MEDICAL EXAMINATION PROCESSES OF RAPE VICTIMS

Improving the medical examination processes for rape victims is crucial to ensuring justice and providing necessary care and support to survivors. A comprehensive policy framework should be established to address the various challenges and gaps in the current system. Firstly, it is essential to ensure that medical examinations are conducted promptly and efficiently. Delays in medical examinations can result in the loss of crucial evidence, which is vital for the prosecution of offenders. Therefore, protocols should mandate immediate medical examinations following the filing of a First Information Report (FIR), with the consent of the victim, to preserve evidence effectively.

Secondly, the training and sensitization of medical professionals are paramount. Healthcare providers should be trained not only in the technical aspects of evidence collection but also in handling victims with empathy and sensitivity. This includes understanding the psychological trauma that victims may experience and ensuring that the examination process does not exacerbate their distress. Regular workshops and training sessions should be conducted to keep medical personnel updated on best practices and legal requirements.

Thirdly, the establishment of dedicated forensic examination units within hospitals can significantly enhance the quality and efficiency of medical examinations. These units should be equipped with the necessary tools and staffed by trained forensic experts who can conduct thorough examinations and ensure the proper collection and preservation of evidence. Additionally, these units should maintain a chain of custody for all collected evidence to prevent any tampering or loss.

⁴⁰ Vageshwari Deswal, "Rights of Rape Victims in India: A Legal Analysis," University of Delhi, LL.M. Syllabus.

Furthermore, the integration of a multidisciplinary approach is recommended. Collaboration between medical professionals, law enforcement, and legal experts can ensure a holistic approach to handling rape cases. This includes the establishment of Sexual Assault Response Teams (SARTs) that can provide coordinated care and support to victims, ensuring that all aspects of their well-being are addressed.

Another critical aspect is the development of standardized protocols and guidelines for medical examinations. These should be based on international best practices and tailored to the specific legal and cultural context of the region. Standardization ensures consistency in the quality of examinations and the reliability of evidence collected, which is crucial for legal proceedings.

Moreover, policies should emphasize the importance of informed consent and confidentiality. Victims should be fully informed about the examination process, the type of evidence being collected, and how it will be used. Their consent should be obtained at every stage, and their privacy must be respected throughout the process. This builds trust and encourages more victims to come forward and report crimes.

Lastly, there should be a focus on continuous monitoring and evaluation of the medical examination processes. Regular audits and assessments can help identify areas for improvement and ensure that the policies are being implemented effectively. Feedback from victims can also provide valuable insights into their experiences and help refine the processes to better meet their needs.

8. CONCLUSION

The medical examination of rape victims in India is a critical component of the criminal justice process, serving both as a means of collecting vital forensic evidence and providing necessary medical care to survivors. Despite existing legal frameworks and guidelines, challenges such as delays, lack of standardized procedures, and inadequate training of medical personnel persist. Addressing these issues requires a concerted effort to implement comprehensive policy reforms that prioritize the timely and sensitive handling of cases. Establishing dedicated forensic units, enhancing the training of healthcare providers, and ensuring the integration of a multidisciplinary approach are essential steps toward improving the system. Moreover,

safeguarding the rights and dignity of victims through informed consent and confidentiality is paramount. Continuous monitoring and evaluation of the processes, along with feedback from survivors, can further refine and enhance the effectiveness of medical examinations. By strengthening these aspects, India can ensure that the medical examination process not only aids in the prosecution of offenders but also supports the healing and empowerment of survivors, ultimately contributing to a more just and responsive legal system. For more detailed information on this topic, resources such as the Justice JS Verma Committee Report provide valuable insights and recommendations.

